EXHIBIT 7

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

POLICE OFFICER TONY GARZELLA, : No. 05-1626

Plaintiff : Civil Action

vs.

BOROUGH OF DUNMORE, BOROUGH OF DUNMORE COUNCIL, BOROUGH OF DUNMORE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION, MICHAEL CUMMINGS, Individually and as Councilman, : JOSEPH LOFTUS, Individually and : as Borough Manager, THOMAS HENNIGAN, Individually and as Councilman, JOSEPH TALUTTO, Individually and as Councilman, : LEONARD VERRASTRO, Individually: and as Councilman, JOHN BARRETT,: Individually and as Civil Service Commissioner, WILLIAM GALLAGHER, Individually and as Civil Service Commissioner, RALPH MARINO, Individually and as Civil Service Commissioner, and DUNMORE POLICE ASSOCIATION, : Defendants

DEPOSITION OF TONY GARZELLA

Taken in the law offices of Marshall, Dennehey, Warner, Coleman and Goggin, 401 Adams Avenue, Scranton, Pennsylvania, on Tuesday, May 2, 2006, commencing at 9:30 a.m., by Wendy Engler Shade, RDR, CRR.

ERSA OF ALLENTOWN
Professional Court Reporters
Commerce Corporate Center Plaza III
5050 Tilghman Street, Suite 120
Allentown, PA 18104
610.366.7119

1 Q.

5 Q.

8 A.

9 O.

13 A.

15 O.

14 you're --

7 civil service exam?

10 1 A. I think the active reserve might have come 2 later, maybe '98, but -- ' 3 Q. But that would have been after you started as a 4 part-timer? 5 A. They changed names so many times. At any point in time did you become an active 6 Q. 7 reserve police officer in Dunmore? 8 A. Yes 9 Q. What year did that happen? 10 A. Maybe '97, '98. 11 0. How were you notified that you were an active 12 reserve officer? 13 A. Just through contract negotiations, they 14 changed our name, because they were working us 40 hours 15 a week, so --16 O. Were you ever a member of the negotiating 17 committee for the FOP?

18 A. Hum-um.

19 O. That's a no?

20 A. No. Sorry.

21 Q. That's all right. Now, prior to the

22 arbitration award in February of 2005, had you

23 participated in any of the negotiations, whether you

24 were a member of a committee or an informal part of an

25 informal group, did you participate in any of the

1 Q. 2 **A**.

22 A.

24 O.

25 A.

21 arbitrator's award?

23 that a test would occur.

Do you remember what union members said that? I believe Billy Springer, Rich Barth.

3 **O**. Anyone else?

4 A. Not that I can remember, no.

5 Q. Did they explain to you why a test may have to

Now, for the arbitration hearing itself, did

6 or there was any discussion that you may have to take a

10 in the DPA or in the borough with respect to any type

I'm not sure if I quite understand what

That's fine. I'll rephrase the question.

17 conversations with anyone in the DPA about the need or

19 would have to take a civil service exam? Was that ever

20 discussed within the membership of the DPA before the

It was just noted that there was a good chance

16 Before the arbitrator's award, did you have any

And how did you find that out?

Just by talking to union members.

18 the possibility that all police officers in the borough

When was the first time that you had ever heard

Did you have any discussions with anyone either

2 you actually -- prior to the actual arbitration award,

When the award came back.

11 of civil service exam before the civil service 12 arbitrator award in February of 2005?

3 did you participate in any of the arbitration hearings?

6 be administered?

7 A. Just to -- because we had to be civil service

8 to become active in the pension plan.

9 Q. Now, have you done any personal research to

10 determine whether or not that's true, that in order to

11 become a member of the pension plan you have to pass a

12 civil service test?

13 A. Myself, no, I didn't research it.

14 Q. How about Mr. Cali, has he done any research to

15 your knowledge?

16 A. I don't know if he did or not.

17 O. Did you have any conversations with Mr. Cali

18 where you discussed whether it was necessary to pass a

19 civil service exam in order to receive a pension?

20 A. Yeah. We talked about it.

21 **Q**. Tell me about those conversations. What did

22 you talk about?

23 A. Just like he didn't think it was right that we

24 would have to take a civil service test to get into a

25 pension after we've been there for so long, you know.

11

1 negotiations with the borough for the new contract?

2 A. Hum-um.

3 MS. POLLICK: Objection.

4 Q. That's a no?

5 A. Just the conversation that I had with

6 Councilman Hennigan.

And those conversations that you had, were they 7 Q.

8 as part of the official FOP negotiating group?

9 A. No. It wasn't really a negotiation session.

10 MR. HOLROYD: Just a point, this isn't

11 an FOP lodge. It's DPA, Dunmore Police Association.

Do you understand when I was using the term FOP

13 that I was -- in reality should have been referring to

14 the DPA, did you understand that?

15 A.

16 Q. And would your answers change if we substituted

17 the term DPA for FOP?

18 A.

19 Q. When did you have conversations with Councilman

20 Hennigan?

I wouldn't know exactly offhand. Maybe

22 sometime in May. I'm not sure.

23 **Q.** So they would have been conversations that

24 occurred after the arbitration award. Is that correct?

25 A. Correct.

4 (Pages 10 to 13)

12

13

| 14 | 16 |
|--|--|
| 1 Q. Did he explain why he believed it wasn't right? | 1 Q. The conversation you had with Councilman |
| 2 A. No, not that I could recall, but he didn't want | 2 Hennigan in May of 2005, where did that take place? |
| 3 to take a civil service test. | 3 A. At his house. |
| 4 Q. Now, you talked about Officer Springer and | 4 Q. Who was there? |
| 5 Officer Barth. Did you have any discussions with any | 5 A. Myself and Anthony Cali. |
| 6 borough official before the arbitrator's award about | 6 Q. Why did you go to his house? |
| 7 the possibility that you would have to take a civil | 7 A. Anthony called me up and said that he had some |
| 8 service exam in order to receive a pension? | 8 kind of conversation with he was friends with |
| 9 A. Just the conversation with Councilman Hennigan. | 9 Hennigan's wife and I guess they had some kind of |
| 10 Q. My question is specific in time. It's before | 10 disagreement, which I'm not really familiar with. Well |
| 11 the actual arbitrator's award. You had said that the | 11 anyway, I guess Councilman Hennigan wanted to talk to |
| 12 conversation you had with Councilman Hennigan | 12 Anthony Cali and he said come over to my house. |
| 13 A. No, not before. | In the meantime, he was going over |
| 14 Q. Let me just ask the question again so it's | 14 there, I wasn't involved in going over there. Billy |
| 15 clear. Did you have any conversations with any | 15 Bonavoglia was going with him and I didn't know |
| 16 Councilperson or the borough manager or any member of | 16 anything about it. In the meantime Billy Bonavoglia |
| 17 the Civil Service Commission or any other borough | 17 couldn't go. Anthony called me up. He said will you |
| 18 official or employee other than a police officer about | 18 come with me, he said, and see what he has to say, so |
| 19 the possibility that you would have to pass a civil | 19 they wouldn't think that I was trying to negotiate a |
| 20 service test in order to receive a pension? | 20 contract or do anything behind the union's back. |
| 21 MS. POLLICK: Objection. Compound | 21 Q. That's what Officer Cali told you? |
| 22 question. | 22 A. Yeah. |
| 23 A. Not that I recall, no. | 23 Q. He didn't want the union to think that he was |
| 24 Q. How did you find out about the arbitrator | 24 trying to negotiate behind their back? |
| 25 award? | 25 A. Negotiate à contract behind their back. |
| 15 | 17 |
| 1 A. I think it was e-mailed to me. | 1 Q. Did he say anything else to you during that |
| 2 Q. By whom? | 2 conversation? |
| 3 A. By Councilman Springer, I think. | 3 A. Hum-um. |
| | 1 |
| 4 Q. What did you do when you received the e-mail? | 4 Q. No? |
| 5 A. Just read it. | 4 Q. No? 5 A. No. |
| 5 A. Just read it. 6 Q. Did you have any opinion or feeling about | 4 Q. No? 5 A. No. 6 Q. You have to say yes or no. |
| 5 A. Just read it. 6 Q. Did you have any opinion or feeling about 7 having to take a civil service exam before the | 4 Q. No? 5 A. No. 6 Q. You have to say yes or no. 7 A. Sorry. |
| 5 A. Just read it. 6 Q. Did you have any opinion or feeling about 7 having to take a civil service exam before the 8 arbitrator award? | 4 Q. No? 5 A. No. 6 Q. You have to say yes or no. 7 A. Sorry. 8 Q. After that conversation, what happened? |
| 5 A. Just read it. 6 Q. Did you have any opinion or feeling about 7 having to take a civil service exam before the 8 arbitrator award? 9 A. Yeah, nervous. | 4 Q. No? 5 A. No. 6 Q. You have to say yes or no. 7 A. Sorry. 8 Q. After that conversation, what happened? 9 A. We went to Hennigan's house. |
| 5 A. Just read it. 6 Q. Did you have any opinion or feeling about 7 having to take a civil service exam before the 8 arbitrator award? 9 A. Yeah, nervous. 10 Q. Now, you said that Officer Cali was he had | 4 Q. No? 5 A. No. 6 Q. You have to say yes or no. 7 A. Sorry. 8 Q. After that conversation, what happened? 9 A. We went to Hennigan's house. 10 Q. Now, when you went to Hennigan's house, had the |
| 5 A. Just read it. 6 Q. Did you have any opinion or feeling about 7 having to take a civil service exam before the 8 arbitrator award? 9 A. Yeah, nervous. 10 Q. Now, you said that Officer Cali was he had 11 voiced some concern about the need to take a civil | 4 Q. No? 5 A. No. 6 Q. You have to say yes or no. 7 A. Sorry. 8 Q. After that conversation, what happened? 9 A. We went to Hennigan's house. 10 Q. Now, when you went to Hennigan's house, had the 11 civil service exam been scheduled already? |
| 5 A. Just read it. 6 Q. Did you have any opinion or feeling about 7 having to take a civil service exam before the 8 arbitrator award? 9 A. Yeah, nervous. 10 Q. Now, you said that Officer Cali was he had 11 voiced some concern about the need to take a civil 12 service exam, correct? | 4 Q. No? 5 A. No. 6 Q. You have to say yes or no. 7 A. Sorry. 8 Q. After that conversation, what happened? 9 A. We went to Hennigan's house. 10 Q. Now, when you went to Hennigan's house, had the 11 civil service exam been scheduled already? 12 A. I believe it was, yes. |
| 5 A. Just read it. 6 Q. Did you have any opinion or feeling about 7 having to take a civil service exam before the 8 arbitrator award? 9 A. Yeah, nervous. 10 Q. Now, you said that Officer Cali was he had 11 voiced some concern about the need to take a civil 12 service exam, correct? 13 A. What do you mean, that he wanted to take a | 4 Q. No? 5 A. No. 6 Q. You have to say yes or no. 7 A. Sorry. 8 Q. After that conversation, what happened? 9 A. We went to Hennigan's house. 10 Q. Now, when you went to Hennigan's house, had the 11 civil service exam been scheduled already? 12 A. I believe it was, yes. 13 Q. Had you taken it yet? |
| 5 A. Just read it. 6 Q. Did you have any opinion or feeling about 7 having to take a civil service exam before the 8 arbitrator award? 9 A. Yeah, nervous. 10 Q. Now, you said that Officer Cali was he had 11 voiced some concern about the need to take a civil 12 service exam, correct? 13 A. What do you mean, that he wanted to take a 14 test? | 4 Q. No? 5 A. No. 6 Q. You have to say yes or no. 7 A. Sorry. 8 Q. After that conversation, what happened? 9 A. We went to Hennigan's house. 10 Q. Now, when you went to Hennigan's house, had the 11 civil service exam been scheduled already? 12 A. I believe it was, yes. 13 Q. Had you taken it yet? 14 A. No. |
| 5 A. Just read it. 6 Q. Did you have any opinion or feeling about 7 having to take a civil service exam before the 8 arbitrator award? 9 A. Yeah, nervous. 10 Q. Now, you said that Officer Cali was he had 11 voiced some concern about the need to take a civil 12 service exam, correct? 13 A. What do you mean, that he wanted to take a 14 test? 15 Q. No. You testified earlier that Officer Cali | 4 Q. No? 5 A. No. 6 Q. You have to say yes or no. 7 A. Sorry. 8 Q. After that conversation, what happened? 9 A. We went to Hennigan's house. 10 Q. Now, when you went to Hennigan's house, had the 11 civil service exam been scheduled already? 12 A. I believe it was, yes. 13 Q. Had you taken it yet? 14 A. No. 15 Q. Who was present for that meeting? |
| 5 A. Just read it. 6 Q. Did you have any opinion or feeling about 7 having to take a civil service exam before the 8 arbitrator award? 9 A. Yeah, nervous. 10 Q. Now, you said that Officer Cali was he had 11 voiced some concern about the need to take a civil 12 service exam, correct? 13 A. What do you mean, that he wanted to take a 14 test? 15 Q. No. You testified earlier that Officer Cali 16 had said to you that he didn't think you needed to take | 4 Q. No? 5 A. No. 6 Q. You have to say yes or no. 7 A. Sorry. 8 Q. After that conversation, what happened? 9 A. We went to Hennigan's house. 10 Q. Now, when you went to Hennigan's house, had the 11 civil service exam been scheduled already? 12 A. I believe it was, yes. 13 Q. Had you taken it yet? 14 A. No. 15 Q. Who was present for that meeting? 16 A. The three of us. |
| 5 A. Just read it. 6 Q. Did you have any opinion or feeling about 7 having to take a civil service exam before the 8 arbitrator award? 9 A. Yeah, nervous. 10 Q. Now, you said that Officer Cali was he had 11 voiced some concern about the need to take a civil 12 service exam, correct? 13 A. What do you mean, that he wanted to take a 14 test? 15 Q. No. You testified earlier that Officer Cali 16 had said to you that he didn't think you needed to take 17 a civil service exam in order to receive a pension, | 4 Q. No? 5 A. No. 6 Q. You have to say yes or no. 7 A. Sorry. 8 Q. After that conversation, what happened? 9 A. We went to Hennigan's house. 10 Q. Now, when you went to Hennigan's house, had the 11 civil service exam been scheduled already? 12 A. I believe it was, yes. 13 Q. Had you taken it yet? 14 A. No. 15 Q. Who was present for that meeting? 16 A. The three of us. 17 Q. Was Mr. Hennigan's wife there? |
| 5 A. Just read it. 6 Q. Did you have any opinion or feeling about 7 having to take a civil service exam before the 8 arbitrator award? 9 A. Yeah, nervous. 10 Q. Now, you said that Officer Cali was he had 11 voiced some concern about the need to take a civil 12 service exam, correct? 13 A. What do you mean, that he wanted to take a 14 test? 15 Q. No. You testified earlier that Officer Cali 16 had said to you that he didn't think you needed to take 17 a civil service exam in order to receive a pension, 18 correct? | 4 Q. No? 5 A. No. 6 Q. You have to say yes or no. 7 A. Sorry. 8 Q. After that conversation, what happened? 9 A. We went to Hennigan's house. 10 Q. Now, when you went to Hennigan's house, had the 11 civil service exam been scheduled already? 12 A. I believe it was, yes. 13 Q. Had you taken it yet? 14 A. No. 15 Q. Who was present for that meeting? 16 A. The three of us. 17 Q. Was Mr. Hennigan's wife there? 18 A. She was there but she had left. |
| 5 A. Just read it. 6 Q. Did you have any opinion or feeling about 7 having to take a civil service exam before the 8 arbitrator award? 9 A. Yeah, nervous. 10 Q. Now, you said that Officer Cali was he had 11 voiced some concern about the need to take a civil 12 service exam, correct? 13 A. What do you mean, that he wanted to take a 14 test? 15 Q. No. You testified earlier that Officer Cali 16 had said to you that he didn't think you needed to take 17 a civil service exam in order to receive a pension, 18 correct? 19 A. Correct. | 4 Q. No? 5 A. No. 6 Q. You have to say yes or no. 7 A. Sorry. 8 Q. After that conversation, what happened? 9 A. We went to Hennigan's house. 10 Q. Now, when you went to Hennigan's house, had the 11 civil service exam been scheduled already? 12 A. I believe it was, yes. 13 Q. Had you taken it yet? 14 A. No. 15 Q. Who was present for that meeting? 16 A. The three of us. 17 Q. Was Mr. Hennigan's wife there? 18 A. She was there but she had left. 19 Q. What time of day was this meeting? |
| 5 A. Just read it. 6 Q. Did you have any opinion or feeling about 7 having to take a civil service exam before the 8 arbitrator award? 9 A. Yeah, nervous. 10 Q. Now, you said that Officer Cali was he had 11 voiced some concern about the need to take a civil 12 service exam, correct? 13 A. What do you mean, that he wanted to take a 14 test? 15 Q. No. You testified earlier that Officer Cali 16 had said to you that he didn't think you needed to take 17 a civil service exam in order to receive a pension, 18 correct? | 4 Q. No? 5 A. No. 6 Q. You have to say yes or no. 7 A. Sorry. 8 Q. After that conversation, what happened? 9 A. We went to Hennigan's house. 10 Q. Now, when you went to Hennigan's house, had the 11 civil service exam been scheduled already? 12 A. I believe it was, yes. 13 Q. Had you taken it yet? 14 A. No. 15 Q. Who was present for that meeting? 16 A. The three of us. 17 Q. Was Mr. Hennigan's wife there? 18 A. She was there but she had left. 19 Q. What time of day was this meeting? 20 A. Afternoon, 2, 3. |
| 5 A. Just read it. 6 Q. Did you have any opinion or feeling about 7 having to take a civil service exam before the 8 arbitrator award? 9 A. Yeah, nervous. 10 Q. Now, you said that Officer Cali was he had 11 voiced some concern about the need to take a civil 12 service exam, correct? 13 A. What do you mean, that he wanted to take a 14 test? 15 Q. No. You testified earlier that Officer Cali 16 had said to you that he didn't think you needed to take 17 a civil service exam in order to receive a pension, 18 correct? 19 A. Correct. 20 Q. Did he voice any opinion about whether or not 21 he wanted to take a civil service exam? | 4 Q. No? 5 A. No. 6 Q. You have to say yes or no. 7 A. Sorry. 8 Q. After that conversation, what happened? 9 A. We went to Hennigan's house. 10 Q. Now, when you went to Hennigan's house, had the 11 civil service exam been scheduled already? 12 A. I believe it was, yes. 13 Q. Had you taken it yet? 14 A. No. 15 Q. Who was present for that meeting? 16 A. The three of us. 17 Q. Was Mr. Hennigan's wife there? 18 A. She was there but she had left. 19 Q. What time of day was this meeting? |
| 5 A. Just read it. 6 Q. Did you have any opinion or feeling about 7 having to take a civil service exam before the 8 arbitrator award? 9 A. Yeah, nervous. 10 Q. Now, you said that Officer Cali was he had 11 voiced some concern about the need to take a civil 12 service exam, correct? 13 A. What do you mean, that he wanted to take a 14 test? 15 Q. No. You testified earlier that Officer Cali 16 had said to you that he didn't think you needed to take 17 a civil service exam in order to receive a pension, 18 correct? 19 A. Correct. 20 Q. Did he voice any opinion about whether or not 21 he wanted to take a civil service exam? | 4 Q. No? 5 A. No. 6 Q. You have to say yes or no. 7 A. Sorry. 8 Q. After that conversation, what happened? 9 A. We went to Hennigan's house. 10 Q. Now, when you went to Hennigan's house, had the 11 civil service exam been scheduled already? 12 A. I believe it was, yes. 13 Q. Had you taken it yet? 14 A. No. 15 Q. Who was present for that meeting? 16 A. The three of us. 17 Q. Was Mr. Hennigan's wife there? 18 A. She was there but she had left. 19 Q. What time of day was this meeting? 20 A. Afternoon, 2, 3. 21 Q. Did you notify any member of the DPA that you |
| 5 A. Just read it. 6 Q. Did you have any opinion or feeling about 7 having to take a civil service exam before the 8 arbitrator award? 9 A. Yeah, nervous. 10 Q. Now, you said that Officer Cali was he had 11 voiced some concern about the need to take a civil 12 service exam, correct? 13 A. What do you mean, that he wanted to take a 14 test? 15 Q. No. You testified earlier that Officer Cali 16 had said to you that he didn't think you needed to take 17 a civil service exam in order to receive a pension, 18 correct? 19 A. Correct. 20 Q. Did he voice any opinion about whether or not 21 he wanted to take a civil service exam? 22 A. He didn't want to take one, no. | 4 Q. No? 5 A. No. 6 Q. You have to say yes or no. 7 A. Sorry. 8 Q. After that conversation, what happened? 9 A. We went to Hennigan's house. 10 Q. Now, when you went to Hennigan's house, had the 11 civil service exam been scheduled already? 12 A. I believe it was, yes. 13 Q. Had you taken it yet? 14 A. No. 15 Q. Who was present for that meeting? 16 A. The three of us. 17 Q. Was Mr. Hennigan's wife there? 18 A. She was there but she had left. 19 Q. What time of day was this meeting? 20 A. Afternoon, 2, 3. 21 Q. Did you notify any member of the DPA that you 22 were going to Mr. Hennigan's house? |
| 5 A. Just read it. 6 Q. Did you have any opinion or feeling about 7 having to take a civil service exam before the 8 arbitrator award? 9 A. Yeah, nervous. 10 Q. Now, you said that Officer Cali was he had 11 voiced some concern about the need to take a civil 12 service exam, correct? 13 A. What do you mean, that he wanted to take a 14 test? 15 Q. No. You testified earlier that Officer Cali 16 had said to you that he didn't think you needed to take 17 a civil service exam in order to receive a pension, 18 correct? 19 A. Correct. 20 Q. Did he voice any opinion about whether or not 21 he wanted to take a civil service exam? 22 A. He didn't want to take one, no. 23 Q. Why not? Did he explain that to you? | 4 Q. No? 5 A. No. 6 Q. You have to say yes or no. 7 A. Sorry. 8 Q. After that conversation, what happened? 9 A. We went to Hennigan's house. 10 Q. Now, when you went to Hennigan's house, had the 11 civil service exam been scheduled already? 12 A. I believe it was, yes. 13 Q. Had you taken it yet? 14 A. No. 15 Q. Who was present for that meeting? 16 A. The three of us. 17 Q. Was Mr. Hennigan's wife there? 18 A. She was there but she had left. 19 Q. What time of day was this meeting? 20 A. Afternoon, 2, 3. 21 Q. Did you notify any member of the DPA that you 22 were going to Mr. Hennigan's house? 23 A. I didn't, no. |

1 A. I don't know, no.

2 Q. Did you ask him whether or not he notified

3 anybody at the DPA?

4 A. I told him that he should tell them, you know,

5 that we're going there. I don't know if he ever did or

6 not.

7 Q. Why did you tell him that?

8 A. Just because I know there was still

9 negotiations going on where the contract could have

10 been settled or not, we didn't know.

11 Q. And why is that significant?

12 MS. POLLICK: Objection.

13 Mischaracterization of prior testimony.

14 A. Excuse me?

15 Q. There were negotiations going on at the time?

16 A. I believe right down to the last minute before

17 the arbitration came back.

And you felt that the DPA should be aware of 18 **O**.

19 the fact that there were two police officers who were

20 talking to a Borough Council member during the

21 negotiating process, correct?

22 MS. POLLICK: Objection.

23 Mischaracterization of prior testimony. Assumes facts

24 not into evidence.

25 Q. Correct? 18

So when you're talking about what Mr. Hennigan

20

21

2 is referring to the fact that people wanted to be paid

3 quickly or immediately, are you talking about bringing

4 the reserve officers' pay up to the pay or equal pay of

5 the full-time officers?

6 A. Through a scale. Not all at one time.

7 O. And you were aware before this meeting with Mr.

8 Hennigan that that was one of the sticking points of

9 the negotiations, did you not?

10 MS. POLLICK: Objection. Assumes facts

11 not into evidence.

12 A. Correct

13 O. Now, the other issue of course that was a

14 sticking point in the negotiations was how could

15 reserve officers get into the pension system, correct?

MS. POLLICK: Objection. Assumes facts

17 not into evidence.

18 A. One more time, please.

One of the other sticking points that you were 19 Q.

20 aware of during the negotiating process was how the

21 reserve officers could become eligible to receive a

22 pension?

23 MS. POLLICK: Same objection.

24 A. Correct.

25 Q. What if anything did Officer Cali say to Mr.

19

1 A. Right.

2 0. Now, when you went to the house, tell me what

3 happened.

They just spoke back and forth. He wanted to 4 A.

know -- like Anthony asked Councilman Hennigan like how

6 the situation transpired, where we were, we went to

7 arbitration and how the whole test came about and that

8 we thought it could have been settled and it wasn't

9 settled.

10 And Councilman Hennigan said there's

11 facts on both sides that are at fault and basically

12 that's it. Councilman Hennigan was worried because he

13 said that we can't hire everybody, but to pay all the

14 money up front, that it would be too much at one time.

15 And I mean it was basically just between them two.

Were part of the issues, and correct me if I'm

17 wrong, part of the issues that were being negotiated

18 between the DPA and the borough was whether or not the

19 reserve officers could become full-time police officers

20 and receive the same pay and benefits as full-time

21 police officers?

22

MS. POLLICK: Objection. Assumes facts 23 not into evidence and vague. No time.

24 **Q**. Go ahead. You can answer it.

25 A. Correct. 1 Hennigan?

2 A. He just said if something could be worked out,

3 you know, where it wouldn't cost a fortune for the

4 borough all at one time, if it could have been

5 structured, if the contract could be stretched out say

6 at least two more years, and he just said bring it back

7 to your union to see what they would go for.

How did you feel about that meeting? Did you

9 feel comfortable that Officer Cali, who was not a part

10 of the negotiating committee of the DPA, was

11 discussing --

12 A. He was part -- he was part of the negotiating

13 committee.

He was, I'm sorry. Who was on the negotiating 14 Q.

15 committee for the DPA at that time?

16 A. I believe Billy Springer, Rich Barth, Billy

17 Bonavoglia and Anthony Cali.

To your knowledge, did any member of that

19 committee conduct negotiations without any other member

20 of the committee present?

21 MS. POLLICK: Objection. Lack of

22 personal knowledge. Assumes facts not into evidence.

23 A. Not that I know of.

24 Q. Did you take any notes from that meeting?

25 A. Hum-um.

6 (Pages 18 to 21)

22 24 1 unofficially, see him around town? 1 Q. That's a no? 2 **A.** No. That was the first time I met him. 2 A. 3 Q. Did Officer Cali take any notes? 3 O. How about Officer Cali, did you ever know 4 whether he had any contacts with Mr. Hennigan before 4 A. I don't think so, no. 5 **Q**. Do you know whether Mr. Hennigan took any MS. POLLICK: Objection. Lack of 6 6 notes? 7 personal knowledge. 7 A. 8 A. I don't know. How long did the meeting last? 8 Q. 9 Q. How did Officer Cali know Mr. Hennigan's wife? 9 A. About an hour. 10 A. I believe she ran like a vacation company. If 10 Q. What else was discussed during that meeting, if 11 that's the next -- I mean I don't know if that's the 11 anything? 12 A. I told him that I didn't think it was fair that 12 only, but I know she books like vacations for people. Had you had any conversations with her before 13 **Q**. 13 we were here for so long and we would have to take a 14 that day? 14 civil service test after working almost ten years 15 A. No. I don't know. 15 full-time when there was other people in the borough Now, you said she left. Did she leave before 16 that enjoyed a pension, full-time salary, I mean, and 16 Q. 17 the meeting started or she left at some point while the 17 they're not civil servants. They never took a test. 18 Then we have some guys that actually just paid a dollar 18 meeting was ongoing? 19 to become civil service. 19 A. Before. 20 Q. When the meeting was over, what did you and Mr. 20 **O**. What else did you say? 21 A. 21 Cali do? That's just -- I didn't say too much there. 22 Q. When you said that, did Mr. Hennigan respond in 22 A. I went home. 23 O. What did Officer Cali do? 23 any way? 24 A. I don't know. I can't remember exactly what his response was. 24 A. 25 Q. Did you or he speak after the meeting? In 25 O. How did the meeting end? 23 25 1 other words, as you're walking to your cars or Just between Anthony and Thomas Hennigan, they 2 whatever, did you have any discussion about hey, how 2 just -- he just asked him to bring back to the union to 3 did that go or anything like that? 3 see if something could be worked out where we can I told him, I said if something's going to 4 stretch the time frame of the contract, instead of like 5 happen, you got to notify the union and let them know 5 I think it was a four or five year contract, to stretch 6 what's going on. 6 it out to six or seven years so the borough wouldn't 7 Q. What did you do to study for the civil service 7 have the burden of paying everything to the guys. 8 exam? 8 Q. Was Officer Cali, was he receptive to that 9 proposal? 9 A. Study quide that the borough gave us. I bought 10 one of them civil service books just to practice up. 10 A. Um-hum. Anything else? 11 0. 11 Q. Is that a yes? 12 A. 12 A. Yes. Sorry. No. How about you? What did you think of that 13 O. When did you purchase the book? 13 **Q**. Maybe about a month after we found out we would 14 A. 14 proposal? 15 have to take a test, if not sooner. I don't remember. I wasn't really too sure. I didn't think So would it have been sometime in February or 16 anything of it really. I mean after I left there, that 16 O. 17 March of 2005? 17 was the end of it. Did Mr. Hennigan threaten you during that 18 A. Correct. 18 Q. 19 **Q**. And the study guide, when did you start using 19 meeting? 20 A. 20 that? Did he threaten Officer Cali during that 21 A. As soon as we received it. 21 Q. 22 **Q**. When was that? 22 meeting? 23 A. I think it was like six days before the test. 23 A. Did you do anything else other than use the --Prior to that meeting, did you ever have any 24 Q. 24 Q. 25 strike that. 25 occasion to talk to Mr. Hennigan, you know,

7 (Pages 22 to 25)

30 32 1 to you the type of test he took, correct? So when you had this conversation it would have 1 Q. 2 been closer in time to the February 2005 arbitrator's 2 A. Correct. 3 Q. He told you that it was timed and it had 3 award? 4 certain sections? 4 A. I don't remember exactly. 5 **A.** Right. 5 Q. Did Mr. Loftus threaten you during that Based on what Danny told you, obviously you 6 conversation? 6 O. 7 didn't sit with Danny to take the test, but based on 7 A. No. 8 Q. Before you took the civil service test, did Mr. 8 what Danny told you, was the test that you took similar 9 to the test that Danny described to you? 9 Loftus ever threaten you? 10 A. 10 A. Yes. No. 11 0. Other than talking to Danny Jones, did you talk 11 O. The members of the Civil Service Commission, 12 to any other officers who had taken a civil service 12 did you know who they were before the exam was 13 exam before you took the one in Dunmore? 13 administered? 14 A. Not that I can recall. 14 A. Yes. I don't know. I only know one person on 15 **O**. Did Danny give you any tips on how to prepare? 15 the board. 16 A. No, not really. 16 **O**. Who is that? 17 Q. The exam itself, when did that take place? 17 A. Mr. Barrett. 18 A. Which one now? 18 **Q**. How do you know him? 19 Q. The one you had to take, the civil service 19 A. He was my school teacher. 20 exam. 20 O. Did you ever have any -- did you ever have any 21 conversations with Mr. Barrett about the civil service 21 A. I believe it was the 21st of May. 22 O. Where did it take place? 22 exam? 23 A. 23 A. At Dunmore High School. 24 Q. Who took the test that day? 24 Q. And you never -- you don't know who the other 25 A. All the active reserve officers. 25 two members are. Is that correct? 31 33 1 A. 1 Q. And did all the active reserve officers show up I may know Gallagher if I see him, but I'm not 2 for the test? 2 -- Marino, I don't know. 3 A. I believe so, yes. 3 Q. Did you ever have any conversations with Mr. 4 Q. Other than the one conversation with Councilman 4 Gallagher about the civil service test? 5 Hennigan, did you have any other conversations with any 5 **A**. Did you ever have any conversations with Mr. 6 other Borough Council members before you took the civil 6 O. 7 service exam? 7 Marino about the civil service test? 8 A. Not that I recall. 8 A. Hum-um. 9 Q. Did you ever talk to Mr. Loftus, the borough 9 Q. That's a no? 10 A. 10 manager, before you took the civil service exam? 11 Q. 11 A. About --The Civil Service Commission solicitor, Frank 12 Q. About the test. 12 O'Neill, do you know him? 13 A. 13 A. I might have briefly. 14 O. Do you remember what that conversation was 14 O. Ever have any conversations with him before the 15 about? 15 civil service test? 16 A. Just I think it was when the contract came back 16 A. Not that I'm aware of, no. Councilman Joseph Talutto, did you ever have 17 or something or there might have been a test involved 17 Q. 18 any conversations with him about the civil service 18 with it or something. 19 Q. What does that mean, when the contract came 19 **test?** 20 back? 20 A. Before or after? 21 A. When the contract came back that he thinks that 21 **Q.** Before. 22 we would have to take a civil service test to get our 22 A. 23 jobs, our full-time jobs. 23 Q. Leonard Verrastro, V-E-R-R-A-S-T-R-O, did you 24 Q. You mean when the arbitration award came out? 24 ever have any conversation with Councilman Verrastro 25 A. 25 before the civil service test? Yeah.

9 (Pages 30 to 33)

42 44 1 to make anybody really fail. And he said but, however, 1 Q. The other members of the police department who 2 complained about the test, were they retaliated 2 if you get more than I think it was 22 or 23 answers 3 against? 3 wrong, he said, you will fail the test. And that's it. 4 We just took it from there. 4 A. 5 Q. Do you know why? 5 Q. Did they hand anything out to you other than 6 A. What do you mean now? 6 the test? 7 Q. Well, you said that you weren't the only one 7 A. Yes. A piece of paper. 8 that complained that the test was unfair, correct? 8 O. What was on the piece of paper? 9 A. Well, mostly all the guys complained. 9 A. Just 70 percent was passing for the written 10 Q. Right. But only three failed the test, right? 10 section, I think, and 30 percent was for the oral MS. POLLICK: Objection. 11 interviews. It was like a basic piece of paper. 11 12 Mischaracterization of testimony. Assumes facts not Did that piece of paper say anything else, to 12 0. 13 into evidence. 13 your knowledge? 14 A. It did, but I can't recall exactly what it 14 A. We didn't fail. 15 Q. According to the borough only three failed the 15 said. 16 test. Was there anything on that piece of paper that 16 Q. 17 A. According to the borough. 17 explained that you had to get a 70 percent in each of 18 Q. 18 the sections? Correct? 19 A. 19 A. Correct. No. The test itself, were there any instructions on 20 O. But everybody complained that it was unfair? 20 O. 21 MS. POLLICK: Objection. Lack of 21 the test about what a passing grade would be? 22 personal knowledge. 22 A. Basically everybody that I know. How long did you have to take the test? 23 A. 23 Q. So my question is how come the borough didn't 24 O. 24 A. I think it was a 75 minute test, but I'm not 25 sure. 25 fail everybody else but only failed you three? 45 43 1 A. I don't know. Was there any more discussion before the test 1 Q. 2 **Q**. Following the test, when did you get your 2 was taken other than what you've already testified to, 3 results? 3 either from the chief of Bloomsburg or from Mr. 4 O'Neill? 4 A. I know it was -- I think it was like ten days after everybody else was notified. They had an old 5 A. No. address. They mailed it to an old address. Did Mr. O'Neill stay in the room for the 6 **O**. 7 You have no reason to believe that that was 7 duration of the test? Ο. I believe he did. I'm not sure though. He sat 8 done intentionally so that you wouldn't get your score, 9 do you? 9 behind me. 10 A. 10 Q. Say that again. 11 A. He sat behind me, so --11 Q. You got your score in the mail? How about the chief from Bloomsburg, was he 12 A. Correct. 12 Q. 13 Q. Was that a letter that you received from Mr. 13 there for the duration of the test? 14 O'Neill? 14 A. Yes, he was. When the test was finished, what happened? 15 A. Um-hum. 15 Q. 16 A. They just collected them. 16 Q. That's a yes? 17 A. Other than failing the test, do you believe Correct. 17 Q. $18\,$ there's anything else that the borough did to retaliate What did you do when you got the letter? 18 Q. 19 against you for complaining about having to take the 19 A. Read it, couldn't believe it. 20 test? 20 Q. What did you do then after that? 21 **A.** I was just in shock that they did stuff like 21 A. I didn't fail the test. Anything else that anybody from the borough did 22 that. 23 Q. Did you call anybody in the DPA? 23 to retaliate against you other than what you've already I might have and I'm not sure if I did or not. 24 testified? 24 A. 25 A. 25 I can't say for sure. No.

12 (Pages 42 to 45)

62 64 1 Q. -- working a schedule? 1 borough manager, about the test? 2 A. 2 A. No. After the test, the hours that you worked, were Do you know whether Officer Cali spoke to any 3 Q. 3 Q. 4 they altered in any way? 4 Borough Council members after the test? 5 A. Not right after the test. Maybe a month, six MS. POLLICK: Objection. Lack of 6 weeks after. 6 personal knowledge. And how were your hours altered? 7 Q. I don't know. Do you know whether Officer Cali spoke to Mr. 8 A. I was put on midnights. How are shifts -- how are people assigned to a 9 0. 9 Loftus after the test? 10 shift? I don't know. 11 MS. POLLICK: Objection. Lack of 11 A. We bid by seniority. And how was it that you went to midnights? 12 personal knowledge. 12 Q. Because I lost my seniority. 13 A. Do you know whether Officer Cali spoke to any Under the collective bargaining agreement, it's 14 member on the Civil Service Commission after the test? 14 O. MS. POLLICK: Same objection. 15 my understanding that full-time officers have seniority 15 16 over active reserve officers. Is that correct? 16 A. I don't know exactly who he talked to. 17 A. Correct. 17 Q. Before you took the civil service test, what And then within the classification of active 18 rank did you hold with the police department? 18 O. 19 reserve officers, you can have seniority over other 19 A. Patrolman. 20 active reserve officers. Is that correct? And within the DPA, under the collective 20 O. 21 A. Correct. 21 bargaining agreement, what was your position? 22 O. So as a result of remaining as an active 22 A. Patrolman. 23 reserve officer and the other officers passing the test 23 Q. Were you a full-time officer or reserve 24 and being promoted to full-time officer, the seniority, 24 officer? 25 they had higher seniority than you, correct? I was full-time, but they called us reserve 65 63 1 A. Um-hum. 1 officers. So before you took the test you held the rank 2 Q. That's a yes? 2 **Q**. 3 A. Correct. 3 of patrolman, correct? Other than having your shift change, did your 4 Q. Correct. 4 A. 5 hours decrease, increase or did they stay the same? 5 **Q**. And you were an active reserve officer, 6 A. Staved the same. 6 correct? 7 Q. Do you have rotating shifts? A. Correct. No. We bid shifts Monday day, like day shift 3 After you took the test, what rank did you 8 Q. 9 to 11 and midnights are steady. They're steady shifts. 9 hold? When you bid for a shift, how long is that bid 10 0. 10 A. Patrolman. 11 good for? And were you an active reserve officer after 11 Q. 12 A. One year. 12 you took the test? So you're working the midnights -- so you would 13 A. Yes. 14 work the midnight shift for that entire year, correct? Now, are you currently on any type of 14 Q. For one year, yes. 15 A. 15 disability, heart and lung compensation? 16 A. 16 Q. Yeah. 17 A. 17 Q. What are you on now? 18 A. Heart and lung. 19 19 Q. When did that start? 20 g 20 A. The 17th of November. 21 d21 Q. Of '05? 22 22 A. Yes. 23 So when you took the test, you were on patrol, 23 Q. 24 V 24 you were --25 Q. 25 A. Correct.

17 (Pages 62 to 65)

68 66 1 out what happened with the grievance? I just kept asking him exactly what was going 2 Α. 3 on with it. Q. 4 O. And what's your understanding of what happened 5 to the grievance? 0. I don't think anything happened with the 6 A. 7 grievance. When was the last time you spoke to any And when you resume active duty, you'll go back 8 O. Q. to the midnight shift. Is that the way it works? 9 leadership in the union about your grievance? 10 A. I believe I'm on day shift now. This --11 Q. The grievance about the test. You can't ask him. That's your understanding, 11 O. 12 A. 12 is that you've been switched to day shift? In June. Not in awhile. 13 Q. Is there another grievance? 13 A. Yeah. 14 A. There was another grievance filed. 14 Q. Did you file any grievance about the scoring 15 with the borough? 15 Q. By who? 16 A. By myself and Anthony. 16 A. Not with the borough, with the union. 17 Q. Did you file any type of official complaint, 17 Q. When did you file that one? 18 A. When we had our seniority taken off us. 18 grievance, appeal, however you want to term it, with 19 Q. And who did you file that grievance with? 19 the borough about the way the scoring was done? 20 A. With the union. 20 A. No 21 MS. POLLICK: Objection. Assumes facts 21 Q. Do you know what happened to that grievance? 22 A. The last time we had a grievance committee and 22 not into evidence. 23 it was denied after a couple weeks after we sat for the Now, you said you filed a grievance with the 24 union. When did that take place? 24 grievance committee. 25 Q. When were you notified that it was denied? Do 25 A. I think it was June. 69 67 1 you remember what month? June of '05? 1 Q. No, not really. It might have been a month 2 A. Yes. 3 after the meeting, but I'm not quite sure. 3 Q. Shortly after the test results came out? 4 A. 4 0. While you worked for the borough of Dunmore, 5 did you ever work for any other police department? How did you file the grievance? What did you 5 Q. 6 A. physically have to do? 7 O. Did you ever look for a job at any other police Anthony Cali wrote the grievance up and we just, Patrolman Sibio and I read it and we just -- he 8 department? 9 A. 9 filed it and I think the president of the union. 10 Q. Did you look for a job at another police 10 Q. Do you know what happened to the grievance? 11 department before you started at Dunmore? 11 A. No. 12 A. No. Did you ever follow up with the president of 12 **Q**. 13 Q. Where did you grow up? 13 the union to find out what happened? Dunmore. 14 A. 14 A. Yeah. I asked him what was going on with it. 15 O. During the tenure of your employment with the 15 Q. When? 16 A. I couldn't tell you right offhand exactly when. 16 borough, have you ever been disciplined for any reason? 17 A. With the borough? 17 Q. Was it within a couple of months? 18 Q. With the borough. 18 A. Yeah, maybe a couple months, a month. 19 Q. 19 A. Who did you talk to? 20 Q. During your tenure with the borough, have you 20 A. Rich Barth. 21 always remained certified as a police officer? 21 Q. What did he tell you? 22 A. He said he didn't know, that I guess they were 22 A. 23 Q. Have you ever been arrested? 23 in the process of talking to Attorney Jennings and 24 A. 24 trying to get something figured out.

18 (Pages 66 to 69)

Did you work anywhere else after you graduated

Did you follow up with Barth after that to find

25 Q.

25 Q.

78 80 1 Q. Good morning, officer. I don't know if we ever 1 0. Any other grievances? 2 met before, but my name is Steve Holroyd. I represent 2 A. Just that's it. No. 3 Dunmore Police Association in this matter. And I have 3 Q. Now, the arbitration award came out in February 4 of 2005, correct? 4 a few questions for you. I don't expect to take as 5 long as Mr. Gonzales did. 5 A. Correct. Prior to that award coming out, do you recall I would ask that the same instructions 6 Q. 7 he gave you, that you just keep them in mind when I'm 7 whether there were union meetings discussing the asking you questions. 8 possibility of settling the contract prior to the award For starters, you are employed by the 9 coming out? 10 borough of Dunmore Police Department? 10 A. Yes, there was. 11 A. Correct. 11 0. Did you attend those meetings? 12 Q. You're not employed by the Dunmore Police 12 A. 13 Q. 13 Association? Approximately how many meetings were there? 14 A. Correct. 14 A. I couldn't say offhand. 15 O. The Dunmore Police Association, that's your 15 **Q**. At those meetings, was the possibility of a 16 civil service test addressed? 16 union? 17 A. Correct. 17 A. Yeah. They said if we went to arbitration 18 Q. How long have you been in the union? 18 there would be a good chance that we'd possibly be 19 A. I would say it has to be at least ten years 19 taking a civil service test. 20 now. I don't know exactly. I think it was 1996 we got 20 O. During those meetings, was any union member in 21 put in the union. I'm not sure. 21 particular advocating settling the contract prior to an 22 Q. Have you ever held union office? 22 award coming out? 23 A. 23 MS. POLLICK: Objection. Calls for 24 Q. Have you ever run for union office? 24 speculation. Patrolman Springer was vocal on settling it. 25 A. No. 25 A. 79 81 Did you ever campaign for or against anyone in 1 Q. When Patrolman Springer was being vocal about 1 Q. 2 a union election? 2 settling, did he address the test at all? 3 A. 3 **A**. Not openly, no. That there would be a possibility if we went to Other than the grievance regarding the test and 4 arbitration that they would give us a test. 4 Q. 5 I think the grievance you told us about your seniority, 5 **Q**. Was Patrolman Springer concerned about the 6 have you ever filed any other grievances with the 6 test? 7 union? 7 A. Yes, I believe he was. 8 Q. Did he indicate whether or not he wanted to 8 A. Just one grievance that there wasn't enough 9 information on it and they sent it back and they said I 9 take a test? I don't remember, but I don't think he would 10 had to do it over. And what grievance was that? 11 take the test -- I think he might have said he didn't 11 O. 12 A. I had to put more information on it. It was 12 want to take a test. Now, while Patrolman Springer was talking about 13 the one about seniority. 14 O. When was that filed with the union? 14 the possibility of settling, were there any police 15 officers who were adamant against settling and wanting 15 A. I believe it was August, I'm not sure though. 16 Q. 2005? 16 to get an award? 17 A. 17 A. The majority of them were. Yeah. And was Officer Cali in that majority? And the union's response was they needed more 18 Q. 18 Q. 19 information? 19 A. Yes. 20 A. To make it more factual, I believe they used 20 **O.** Now, after the decision came out, how long 21 the term. 21 after the decision came out was the test scheduled? 22 Q. 22 **A.** The award came back I guess sometime in Did you do that? 23 A. 23 February and I think the test was scheduled for the 24 Q. And did you refile the grievance? 24 22nd of May.

21 (Pages 78 to 81)

And I guess the better question would have been

25 Q.

25 A.

Yes.

82 84 1 when were police officers advised that the test was 1 Q. Now, did he offer to continue to prep you? 2 A. 2 scheduled for May? Maybe six weeks after the award came back. I'm 3 O. 3 A. But you didn't take him up on that offer? 4 not sure exactly. 4 A. We just never could get together. 5 Q. 5 **Q**. After the award came out, was there a union Were also prep sessions being done through your 6 meeting to discuss whether to appeal the award? 6 lunch break on your regular shifts, during police 7 officers' lunch breaks? 7 A. I believe there was, yes. 8 Q. Did you attend that meeting? 8 MS. POLLICK: Objection. 9 A. I think I did, yes. 9 Q. Let me rephrase that. Do you know whether 10 Q. And at that meeting, did the union membership 10 there were also prep sessions being done during the 11 vote not to appeal the award? 11 lunch shifts, lunch breaks? 12 12 A. Correct. MS. POLLICK: Objection. Calls for 13 Q. Do you recall what the vote was? 13 speculation. 14 A. 14 A. I don't know. 15 Q. 15 **Q**. After the test was scheduled, did some officers In your complaint, officer, you make a number 16 continue to express concerns about their ability to 16 of allegations that I wanted to explore with you. At 17 take the test? 17 paragraph 18 --18 A. 18 MS. POLLICK: I'm just going to object Yes. 19 Q. Which officers had expressed concerns about 19 to the fact that you're not giving him a copy of the 20 their ability to take the test? 20 complaint and you're referring to a paragraph. 21 21 A. Quite a few of them expressed themselves. MR. HOLROYD: Let's go off the record. 22 **O**. Can you remember who? 22 (Discussion off the record.) 23 A. 23 BY MR. HOLROYD: Myself, Anthony, I know Rich Barth was 24 concerned, you know. The majority of the guys were Officer, you've been handed what's been marked 24 O. 25 concerned. 25 as Garzella Exhibit 3. Let me direct your attention to 83 85 1 0. Was there an Officer Reynolds? 1 page 5 of that complaint. Let me direct your attention 2 **A.** Reynolds. 2 to paragraph 18. There you allege defendants in 3 Q. Now, did any officers offer to tutor other 3 recognition of your years of service failed to promote 4 officers in preparing for this test? 4 slash in effect demoted you in or around June 2005. 5 **A**. 5 Which defendants were you referring to? Yes. 6 Q. And which officers offered to do that? 6 A. I believe the borough. 7 A. 7 Q. Officer Springer. The borough. It's not your contention that the 8 Q. And at this time was there something called a 8 Dunmore Police Association failed to promote you or in 9 police update class going on? 9 effect demoted you? 10 A. Yes. 10 A. Right. 11 Q. 11 Q. And what is that exactly? Similarly, at paragraph 19, where you allege 12 A. You go for your updates, your mandatory updates 12 you received a passing score but defendants had failed 13 that are required by the state. 13 to promote you, which defendants are you referring to 14 there? 14 Q. And at the time were you participating in the 15 updates? 15 A. The borough. 16 A. 16 Q. You're not alleging that the Dunmore Police 17 Q. 17 Association failed to promote you? Was Patrolman Springer offering to prep people 18 after these updates were done? 18 A. 19 A. Um-hum. 19 Q. Similarly at paragraph 20, where again you 20 Q. 20 allege defendants demoted you, that's referring to the And did he prep Officer Reynolds? 21 A. 21 borough? 22 Q. And did he prep you? 22 A. Correct. 23 A. 23 Q. You're not referring to the DPA's having 24 Q. How many times did he prep with you? 24 demoted you. Is that correct? 25 A. I did it once, that one time. 25 A. Correct.

22 (Pages 82 to 85)

86 88 Paragraph 22 where you allege defendants never 1 June of 2005? 1 Q. 2 A. 2 gave Officer Garzella oral or written notice of the I believe so, yes. 3 **Q.** Now, prior, if I understood you correctly, 3 charges against him or opportunity to respond to the 4 charges, you're referring to the borough? Anthony Cali filed that grievance on your behalf and 5 his and Jody's behalf? 5 A. Correct. 6 A. You're not alleging that the Dunmore Police Correct. 6 Q. 7 7 Association never gave you written notice of charges Q. Prior to his filing that grievance was there a union meeting where the issue of the scoring of the 8 against you? 9 A. test was discussed? Correct. 10 A. I believe there was, yes. 10 O. Paragraph 23, which is the next page, you 11 allege defendants never provided Officer Garzella with 11 Q. And during that meeting was a vote taken 12 a pre-failure to promote/demotion hearing or any 12 regarding whether or not to proceed with that 13 post-failure to promote/demotion hearing as required by 13 grievance? 14 law. Again, the defendants you're referring to there 14 A. Yes, there was. 15 **Q**. 15 is the borough? And the vote --16 A. 16 A. Correct. Go ahead. 17 O. You're not alleging that the Dunmore Police 17 O. I'm sorry. And the vote was the membership 18 Association failed to provide you with any hearing? 18 voted not to proceed with the grievance. Is that MS. POLLICK: Objection. Assumes facts 19 correct? 20 not into evidence. 20 A. Correct. 21 Q. 21 A. Correct. And the vote was 18 to 3? 22 A. 22 Q. And finally, at paragraph 24, where you allege Correct. 23 defendants had intentionally failed to provide Officer 23 **O.** And the three votes to proceed with the 24 Garzella with any hearing on those charges, the 24 grievance were your vote, Officer Cali's vote and 25 defendants you're referring to there is the borough of 25 Officer Sibio's vote? 89 87 1 A. Correct. 1 Dunmore? (Witness nods head) 2 Q. But after that meeting Officer Cali filed his 2 A. 3 O. You're not alleging that the Dunmore Police 3 grievance anyway? 4 Association failed to provide you with any hearing or 4 A. He filed it over the scoring of the test. notice of charges? 5 **Q**. But was that the same issue that was decided by 6 6 the membership prior to his filing the grievance? MS. POLLICK: Objection. Assumes facts No. The first grievance was over the whole 7 not in evidence. 7 A. 8 8 test itself. A. 9 Q. 9 Q. So the second grievance was over the scoring of No, it's not correct, or no, you're not 10 the test? 10 alleging the DPA has failed to provide you with a 11 hearing? 11 MS. POLLICK: Objection. Assumes facts 12 A. 12 not into evidence and confusing. Not alleging. 13 A. 13 Q. At paragraph 27, you allege that the defendant 14 Q. So what was discriminatory, arbitrary or in bad 14 Dunmore Police Association has discriminatorily, 15 arbitrarily and in bad faith refused to represent you 15 faith involving as far as the DPA's processing of that 16 grievance? 16 in connection with your grievances. What evidence do 17 MS. POLLICK: Objection. Vague 17 you have to support that contention? 18 question. 18 A. Just the grievance that we filed. 19 A. 19 **O**. And which grievance would that be? Which one now? 20 Q. The grievance about the scoring of the test. 20 A. The first one. 21 A. Because they didn't do anything with us. It's That's the grievance involving the test? 21 Q. 22 A. Or the scoring. 22 so obvious what occurred. 23 **Q**. Did anyone from the union ever advise you why 23 Q. The scoring of the test? 24 they were not proceeding with that grievance? 24 A. Um-hum.

25 Q.

This is a grievance that was filed in about

25 A.

Yes.

90 1 Q. And so this was the seniority list that had 1 Q. Who? 2 full-time police officers ranked ahead of reserve 2 A. We had a phone conversation with Tom Jennings. 3 **Q**. 3 police officers? Who was present on that phone conversation? 4 A. Billy Springer, myself, Anthony Cali and that's 4 A. Correct. 5 it, I think, just the four of us. 5 Q. Do you have any other evidence supporting the What was discussed during that call? 6 allegation that the DPA harassed and publicly 6 O. 7 A. 7 humiliated you? I don't know if the grievance was -- that 8 grievance was discussed, but Attorney Jennings told us, 8 A. Yeah, because just out in public, I mean people 9 he said that we didn't pass the elements and we failed 9 would say to me, you know, you failed the test. And 10 the rumor going around was that I failed the test and I 10 the test. Basically just we failed the test and there 11 was nothing that he can do. And that the best thing 11 actually passed the test. So it was kind of hard to --12 that we could do is probably just negotiate a test for 12 I mean if they did what they were supposed to do and 13 ourselves to take. 13 they looked at all the facts, they'd see that I 14 Q. A second test? 14 actually passed the test. 15 15 Q. When you say people, what people come up to MS. POLLICK: Objection. Assumes facts 16 not into evidence. 16 you? 17 A. Just people in general, like. 17 A. To take a second test. Such as who, other police officers? 18 Q. Any other conversations with union officials 18 Q. 19 A. No, like people if I walk into a store or 19 regarding that grievance? 20 A. None that I know of, no. 20 something, people in there, I had it at least two or 21 three times. 21 **Q.** Did anyone from the union ever tell you that 22 they were refusing to process this grievance because of 22 Q. Can you recall those two or three times for me? 23 A. Once at the smoke shop, the kid behind the 23 anything you had done? 24 counter asked me if I -- something about a test, he 24 A. No, nobody told me. 25 said you have to take a civil service test and you 25 Q. Do you have any other evidence to support your 91 1 contention that the failure to process this grievance 1 failed it and this and that, just going on and on. I 2 was like I didn't fail the test, you know. I passed 2 was discriminatory, arbitrary or in bad faith? 3 MS. POLLICK: Objection. Calls for a 3 the test. Do you remember the kid's name? 4 legal conclusion. 4 O. 5 A. I know his first name is -- I think it's Craig. 5 A. No, not here with me now. 6 Q. At paragraph 28 you allege that the DPA allowed 6 I wouldn't be able to tell you what his last name is. you to be harassed, publicly humiliated and demoted. 7 Q. And approximately when did that conversation 8 What evidence do you have to support that allegation? 8 take place? 9 A. 9 A. They're the ones that demoted me. I mean they This was a few months ago. This is back 10 took my seniority off me originally. 10 towards probably December. 11 Q. The DPA? 11 Q. What other occasions can you recall? 12 A. 12 A. The owner of Sal's restaurant, Sal Ganari, had Yes. 13 Q. I'm sorry. The DPA took your seniority off 13 mentioned it to me. He said that -- he said he was 14 you? 14 happy that some guys failed the test that he didn't 15 A. 15 like, but he said he felt bad for me because he said Yes. 16 that I failed the test. So I mean that was -- I had 16 Q. And how did they do that? 17 A. They wrote a letter saying that we're going to 17 explained to him that I didn't fail the test, I 18 lose our seniority and they said they made up the new 18 actually passed the test. 19 19 seniority list and they sent it over to the borough, And once at a party, I went to another 20 that it was going to be done. I guess they gave them a 20 guy, same conversation over I think it was right around 21 certain amount of time to contest it and it wasn't 21 the time when the lawsuit was filed. And he was 22 contested and I lost my seniority. 22 saying, you know, about me failing the test. And I

24 (Pages 90 to 93)

23 just felt like a jerk, you know what I mean, because I

Who was it that third time, do you remember

24 actually didn't fail the test, I passed the test.

92

93

25 **Q**.

23 Q.

25 A.

This was the seniority list that was prepared

24 after the test results had come in?

Right.

96 94 1 reading it. That if anybody was caught talking to 1 that person's name? 2 A. His last name is Bistran and there's quite a 2 anybody they would take disciplinary action against us, 3 bit of family and I'd be able to find out his first 3 the union members. 4 name when I saw him. But his last name is Bistran. 4 Q. This is the union posted it? Any other evidence to support your allegation 5 A. Yes. 6 that the DPA allowed you to be harassed and publicly 6 Q. It was on the union's board? 7 A. 7 humiliated? 8 A. 8 O. Did you read that notice? 9 **A**. 9 Q. Paragraph 31, you allege that the borough of Yes. 10 Dunmore and union representative Rich Barth and union 10 O. Did you know to what it was referring? 11 representative William Springer were conspiring to 11 A. I believe it was referring to myself and 12 deprive you of your constitutional rights. What 12 Anthony Cali going and talking to Hennigan. 13 evidence do you have to support your contention that 13 O. And I think you told us at the time of that 14 there was a conspiracy to deprive you of your rights? 14 meeting you were not on the negotiating committee? 15 15 A. MS. POLLICK: Objection. Calls for a No, I was not. 16 legal conclusion. 16 Q. After the award had come out in February, did 17 A. The evidence would be just me being in the 17 the negotiating committee continue to exist? 18 situation that I'm in after I pass the test the way I 18 MS. POLLICK: Objection. Calls for 19 was supposed to pass it, and then everything else just 19 speculation, lack of personal knowledge. 20 passed me out. 20 A. I don't know. I believe it did. I don't know. 21 Q. Do you have any evidence that the DPA -- let me 21 Q. What else did the DPA do to publicly criticize 22 or admonish you regarding discussing the civil service 22 withdraw that and ask this. 23 Who administered the civil service test? 23 test? 24 A. 24 A. Nothing. That's it. Civil Service Commission. 25 Q. Did the DPA have any involvement with the 25 Q. That's it. In paragraph 40 you allege that the 95 97 1 DPA has given false information about the scoring of 1 administering of that test? 2 **A.** 2 the civil service test. What evidence do you have in No. 3 MS. POLLICK: Objection. Calls for 3 support of that? 4 speculation. 4 A. A letter that stated that all we needed was I 5 **Q**. Do you know whether the DPA had any hand in 5 believe how many questions were going to be on the test 6 and that 70 was the passing score of the test. 6 scoring the test? 7 Q. Is this a letter that the DPA put out? MS. POLLICK: Objection. Calls for 8 speculation. 8 A. 9 A. 9 Q. No. And do you know from where the DPA got the 10 Q. No, you don't know, or no, they didn't? 10 information regarding that? 11 A. 11 A. From the Civil Service Commission. 12 Q. Do you know whether any representatives of the 12 MS. POLLICK: Objection. Calls for 13 DPA ever met with a member of Borough Council to 13 speculation. The May meeting that you and Officer Cali had 14 discuss the civil service test? 14 Q. 15 A. 15 with Hennigan, you testified that it was initially I don't know of any. 16 MS. POLLICK: Objection. Calls for 16 supposed to be Officers Cali and Bonavoglia going to a 17 meeting? 17 speculation. I don't know of any. 18 A. 18 A. Bonavoglia, yeah. 19 O. At paragraph 39 of your complaint, page 9, you Officer Bonavoglia was president of the DPA 19 **O**. 20 allege that the DPA has publicly criticized and 20 prior to Officer Barth becoming president? 21 A. Correct. 21 admonished its members from discussing the civil 22 service test requirement with agents and employees of 22 Q. And Officer Cali was secretary-treasurer of the 23 the borough of Dunmore. What evidence do you have to 23 DPA prior to Officer Springer? 24 support that section? 24 A. Correct.

25 (Pages 94 to 97)

You were telling us in preparation for the test

They stuck a thing up on the board. I remember

25 Q.

25 A.